Anor Issue 42, Michaelmas 2013

Anor

Editor's Note

Editor's Note

Mae govannen, mellyn nín! Welcome, my friends, to Issue 42 of the Cambridge Tolkien Society's *Anor*! Many thanks to Heather Douglas for the front cover artwork and to our contributors who have provided us with a range of articles for you to enjoy!

In the second instalment of his scholarly saga entitled *Dwarven Economy and Society*, James Baillie provides a comprehensive overview and enlightening discussion of Dwarf demographics and economy from the earliest days of their race right up to the War of the Ring and slightly beyond. James also presents two songs to add to our as yet non-existent songbook.

As well as lyrical stylings, we also have the logical stylings of Hannah Strachan, who submits several rock-solid, utterly water-tight arguments for why Radagast is, in fact, Sauron!

Jack Fleming discusses the nature of heroism in Tolkien's Legendarium, inspired by the CTS' meeting on this topic. Jack offers an argument for the significance of Saruman of Many Colours that goes far beyond him serving as a warning of the dangers of mixing colours in one's laundry.

Samuel Cook helps to bring some clarity to the chronology of the First Age for all those who are unsure who's doing what where and when. Samuel also gives us a new Pentagon-style jargon, which has the potential to turn every noun into an impenetrable description of Entish proportions.

And speaking of Ents, I present some speculations regarding the nature of the Entish mind based on the form and structure of Entish speech and the Entish language.

So, happy reading, happy thinking, and I look forward to being inundated with submissions for the next issue!

<div align="right">

Jamie Douglas, Daeron (Editor of Anor)
Cambridge Tolkien Society
University of Cambridge, Michaelmas 2013

</div>

PS If you were expecting a large pair of door furnishings on this Page 3, you've got the wrong Sun!

Contents

Dwarven Economy and Society: Technology and Demography

James Baillie

This second essay on Dwarven society is really more of an exercise in data-gathering than anything analytical. In the first paper, it was established that Dwarf society was not, to make a fairly obvious point, purely static. The historical period before the rising of the Sun and the first three ages of Middle Earth between them cover around nine thousand years of time, which in terms of the real world is about equivalent to the period between the start of the Neolithic and the Norman Conquest. What this paper seeks to do is to establish, as best it can, a chronological picture of what happened to key metrics in Dwarven society over that time – to boil it down to three key points: where were the Dwarves, how many of them were there, and what sort of technologies and trading networks were available to them?

The Early Hold Period

The time before the coming of the Elves can be disregarded for the purposes of this article, not least because the Dwarves had not yet "awoken". In any case a time period before there were sentient beings making records is, surely, a better subject for those studying Middle Earth's mythology than those looking into its history. We can consider YT (Year of the Trees) 1050 as "the start of recorded history" for this purpose. It is in YT 1250 that we first have a definite record of the Naugrim, as both *The Annals of Aman*[1] and *The Grey Annals*[2] agree. These two documents will be used as the primary guide to the Years of the Trees and the First Age, with *Quenta Silmarillion* taking precedence in any cases where it actually gives an adequate chronology. It should also be noted here that I have taken the assumption that *The Silmarillion* map is accurate, and later possible changes to the locations of Nogrod[3] and Belegost[4] are discarded.

The appearance of the Dwarves gives us an interesting question in itself; they are recorded as coming "over the mountains into Beleriand".[5] Furthermore, *The Silmarillion* says that "far to the east were the most ancient dwellings of the Naugrim".[6] This seems at odds with *Of Dwarves and Men*, in which Tolkien writes that the awakening place of the Firebeards and Broadbeams had been "in the north of Ered Lindon". The mostly likely answer is that the awakening point was simply on the east side of Ered Lindon, and that perhaps the two western kindreds had awoken later than the Longbeards, or that it was not until a migration of Longbeard Dwarves that key "dwarven" technologies spread to what may have been effectively a stone age mountain culture for some years. The possibility that there was a longer migration in larger numbers cannot be wholly discarded, particularly in

---

[1] *Morgoth's Ring*, p.93
[2] *The War of the Jewels*, p. 9 & 10
[3] Occasionally associated with Moria in some of Tolkien's later notes: see *The War of the Jewels*, p.201-202
[4] Sometimes placed in the far south of the Blue Mountains, as was Nogrod. The War of the Jewels, p.202
[5] *Morgoth's Ring*, p.93
[6] *Quenta Silmarillion*, p91

light of the number of commonalities in Dwarf culture and language, but this seems at odds with Dwarf traditions on the subject. A further possibility is that the Dwarves awoke, then moved to a central point (Gundabad probably), before dispersing again; this would fit the theory that Durin had no female companion and that therefore the Longbeards were mostly formed out of other clans. The assumption that seems logical here is that the early Dwarven polities and clans originated in the Ered Luin, the Misty Mountains, and other eastern ranges, but that long distance travel and migration, perhaps of small groups or families, became common at an early stage. We can place the Longbeard polity as the earliest to form, and (given the eastward spread and trend of migration) probably the most numerous. Whilst Dwarves multiply slowly (a more exact discussion of family sizes will have to wait for a later paper), it can be assumed that the Longbeards (far from Angband, with safe havens in the Misty Mountains, and with good nearby farmland and hunting in Eregion or down the Anduin) were in a healthy position to have a growing population from an early stage. The spread of the Longbeards and their contact with the Firebeard and Broadbeam clans, then at a much earlier stage of development, helped establish and maintain the pre-eminence of the Longbeard kin-polity (though its central position must also have been important).

Demographically, the next important question in chronology is the creation of the hold as a settlement unit. Belegost was clearly in existence by YT 1250,[7] and Moria was presumably older (see above). Nogrod can be dated to around the same time; perhaps a rough dating of Belegost and Nogrod to the first half of the thirteenth century, Moria the second half of the twelfth, and Gundabad to the early twelfth would be reasonable. It is never explicitly stated which of Belegost and Nogrod maps to which of the Firebeard and Broadbeam clans – indeed the only reference to either of them associating them with a clan associates Belegost with the Longbeards. This is problematic given the usual association of Durin as the ancestor of the Longbeards; it will be taken as an assumption here that Belegost still maps properly to either the Firebeard or Broadbeam kin, and that references to "Longbeards of Belegost" indicate either a) a significant sub-population of migrant Longbeards at Belegost (not improbable given the attraction of trade with Menegroth), b) the dual use of Longbeards to refer to Dwarves generally as well as the clan, or c) a mixture of the two. Belegost is generally mentioned as having good relationships with Thingol from an early stage,[8] and may well have been the more important trade centre of the two if there were sufficient Longbeards there for it to be noted by the Elves. This early hold period seems to have been a time of demographic expansion, increasing trade along the route from Moria to Menegroth via Belegost, and the establishment of the four major western Dwarf-holds of the First Age.

The trading and technological features of the early hold period can now be assessed. Masonry and metalwork are associated with the Dwarves from their first contact with the Elves, though it is noted that before the influence of elven culture dwarf works had "little

---

[7] *Morgoth's Ring*, p.93
[8] Ibid.

beauty"[9] (at least to the eyes of Men and Elves, presumably). The early Dwarves worked iron and copper, and were accomplished masons. The construction of a road along the main Moria to Menegroth trade route, and the construction of the four early holds (and Menegroth itself), were key achievements in terms of culture and construction. Menegroth and the great Dwarf Road were both constructed by YT 1300.[10] If there were other lesser holds in the Blue and Misty Mountains they are unrecorded, but their existence nevertheless seems probable as mining and food-gathering outposts would have been needed to supply the larger holds. In terms of food and other such basics, holds at this time would have needed to produce most of their own food: given the traditional dwarf dislike of animals and animal husbandry, a mix of hunting and farming seems likely. The mountains would have had poor agricultural soils, and hunting would be quite time-intensive, so the populations supported would likely have been quite low; ten to twelve thousand Dwarves would seem a reasonable estimate for Belegost or Moria at this time, with Gundabad or Nogrod seven or eight thousand apiece. The early hold period seems to have involved fairly frequent fighting, including within and between the dwarf kin-polities,[11] and this in turn drove dwarf expertise in weapon and armour creation. We can place the adoption of chainmail, invented in Belegost,[12] to the period after YT 1300 when external dangers increased; this period saw increased exports of weaponry to Menegroth, particularly from Nogrod, which specialised in weapon-smithing more than its northern neighbour.[13] Steel was probably an invention of the YT 1300-1500 period, too.[14] Trade rapidly became culturally important, and the hoarding culture so often associated with Dwarves must date from this period as, although gold and gems had previously not had cultural significance for them (hence the aforementioned focus on iron and copper and the Elves' perceived lack of beauty in dwarf work), Thingol traded coastal pearls for their work[15] and hoarding behaviour via trade wealth became noteworthy.[16]

The final note on the pre-1500 period (aka before the Years of the Sun begin) should be about the "Petty-Dwarves". The prevailing theory seems to be that these were driven out of the dwarf "communities" (presumably holds), though the reason remains unclear as to whether this was a punishment for criminals, a way of ostracising smaller or weaker members of the community, or as a result of a more significant schism.[17] The split must have occurred after YT 1250 for there to have been established communities for them to be exiled from, but probably well before YT 1500. This 250 'year' period was probably the heyday of Petty-Dwarf society; we know they had settlements at Nulukkhizdîn (later

[9] *The War of the Jewels*, p.10, also *Morgoth's Ring*, p.93

[10] *The War of the Jewels*, p.11, *The Silmarillion*, p.93

[11] *The War of the Jewels*, p.12, *The Silmarillion*, p.94

[12] *The Silmarillion*, p.94

[13] *The War of the Jewels*, p.12, *The Silmarillion*, p.94

[14] Ibid.

[15] *The Silmarillion*, p.92

[16] *The War of the Jewels*, p.204

[17] *The War of the Jewels*, p.388-89

Nargothrond), and Sharbhund (Amon Rûdh, where Mîm is later found). This polity, or at least area, covering what would later be the realm of Nargothrond, seems certainly to have been very much looked down upon by the "Great Dwarves" of the Blue Mountains, although perhaps less than is at times thought; the great Dwarves later considered the Elves' hunting of the Petty-Dwarves to have been a grievance, so, whilst outcasts, to some extent they were clearly still seen as, fundamentally, members of the Dwarf race.

The Classical Kin-Polity Period

The early hold period, as a period of expansion, can be considered to end at around YT 1500. In YT 1497 Morgoth launched attacks on Doriath and Beleriand in general; this, and the subsequent lack of peace, made trade a far more costly enterprise, and it is likely that communications on the other side of the Blue Mountains suffered similar shocks. The second key event of YT 1497 was the coming of the Noldor and in particular the Sons of Fëanor. This was most important in that it led to the very rapid decline of the Petty-Dwarf holds, and thus confined the Dwarves to the Blue Mountains and eastward far more exclusively. Here the reckoning of the Grey Annals changes to Years of the Sun; the changes at this point for the Firebeard and Broadbeam polities should not be overestimated; external trade, primarily in weapons, was getting more difficult but at the same time demand was increasing to compensate, and in any case external trade cannot have comprised the largest share of the economy as all the essentials of food, clothing, and so on were made by the Dwarves themselves. Nevertheless, the expansion of trade ceases after the Years of the Sun begin, and thereafter no new holds are founded, indicating stagnation in population levels.

By FA (First Age) 150 the shock of decreased trade to Doriath could start to be replaced by trade with the Noldor of Caranthir and Maedhros. The siege of Angband can be considered the "classical age" of the Dwarf kin-polity. The Dwarf realms were relatively insular, and traded primarily in weapons over short distances, being largely self-sufficient in other things. Population and resources can be considered fairly stable, with the general disdain of the Elves being a factor against significant population colonisation or expansion, and external and internal trade demand can also be considered fairly consistent. Further east, conditions were probably very different; the early migrations and expansion of Men began to provide new opportunities for trade at this point, though conflict as much as co-operation may have been a feature of early meetings (and in any case, the "swarthy men", who are noted as co-operating more with the Dwarves, are likely to have had relatively little to offer them economically, and indeed became vassals of Elves in general). This period can generally be associated with improved metallurgy; the facemask-helms of Belegost being particularly noted as a technology for their usefulness at the Battle of Unnumbered Tears.[18] The later fifth century saw a more active role for the Dwarves in warfare. The Lord of Belegost led an army at the Fifth Battle in FA 472, and then, much more catastrophically,

---

[18] *The Silmarillion*, p.193

most of the upper strata of Nogrod's society were obliterated in the defeat at Sarn Athrad in FA 503.[19] The former may have caused significant but not deadly losses; the latter effectively destroyed the military strength of Nogrod. Sarn Athrad and the war with Doriath represents perhaps the largest body of utterly conflicting sources of any part of Middle Earth's history; the older tale of the Nauglafring[20] presents both Nogrod and Belegost taking part in the war along with orcish or goblin mercenaries,[21] whereas that in *The Silmarillion* presents it only as a war that Nogrod fought. In either case it was only Nogrod that fought at Sarn Athrad, though if the Nauglafring version is correct the *uzbad* of Belegost may have died after trying to take the Nauglamír at an earlier stage of the campaign.[22]

The First Age Crisis and the Longbeard Trading Period

Nogrod and Belegost effectively disappear from the record after the fall of Doriath. Whilst the shift from the early hold expansion to the classical polities period had seen changes in trade patterns and an end to demographic expansion, the period between Sarn Athrad and about a century into the Second Age (SA) can be seen as a major crisis point in Dwarf society (as, indeed, in the societies of other races). The power of kin-polities essentially broke down as large-scale eastward movements of population occurred, particularly to Moria. The migrations of orcs and goblins in this period meant that the crisis extended far to the east of Beleriand: it is never explicitly stated when Gundabad initially fell,[23] but this seems a likely time period. Other smaller holds were likely victims at this point too; the Iron Hills were cut off,[24] which may have been a first stage in the increasing independence of the leaders there despite their Longbeard ancestry and ties.

As the crisis settled, the dominance of Moria became progressively more obvious.[25] The kings of Durin's line had personal control over the mithril reserves that had been uncovered there,[26] and as a centre for producing dwarven weapons, tools, and armour it now had no rivals, boosted by the flight of Nogrod and Belegost's experienced craftsmen (and quite possibly those of Gundabad and other holds too). The close proximity of Eregion meant that elven trade with Moria could take place easily, but more important by far was increased economic contact with humans. Humans in the First Age are primarily recorded as vassals of the Elves; in the early Second Age along the upper Anduin humans and Dwarves started major economic interactions for the first time. Humans made better scouts, could

---

[19] *The War of the Jewels*, p.346
[20] *The Book of Lost Tales, Vol II*, p.221-251
[21] *The Book of Lost Tales, Vol II*, p.230
[22] Whilst Naugladur of Nogrod is referred to as King, Bodruith of Belegost is referred to as Lord, so I have taken the assumption explained in my previous article that Lord and King mean different things here, with "lord" specifically linked to the role of an individual hold's diplomatic and military commander. See "Dwarven Economy and Society: The Structures of Power", *Anor 41*, p.4-6
[23] Its capture in the SA 1690s by orcs is stated to be a "recapture", indicating it had fallen previously.
[24] *The Peoples Of Middle Earth*, "Of Dwarves and Men" p.305
[25] *The Lord of the Rings, Appendix A Part III*, p.1108
[26] Probably near the end of the First Age, but this is a topic for another paper.

ride horses, and were better at providing food, whereas the Dwarves were able to increase their specialism as miners, road-builders, and smiths.[27] This is the system that was later in place at Erebor, and was also probably adopted in the Blue Mountains (the Iron Hills probably retained more native ability to produce food as they were primarily a mining settlement with few attractions for humans).

The key trade routes in this period led along the old Dwarf Road to the Blue Mountains, and up to the Iron Hills through the Greenwood. The former was diminished, but the first stretch of it into Eregion made Moria the main focus for selling to the Elves of Hollin, with whom the Dwarves had close links,[28] replacing Belegost in that function. The latter became increasingly important, as while Moria focussed increasingly on mithril trade with the Elves and had its own iron reserves, it was the Iron Hills that had sufficient quantities of the eponymous metal to feed demand for iron and steel products among the humans of Anduin. The foundation of the Iron Hills must probably be placed in the First Age, perhaps around the end of the early hold culture or even shortly thereafter, or possibly in the later First Age as in the years after Sarn Athrad eastwards migration had already begun.[29] This period was the high point of Longbeard trade, and it is not too much of a stretch to suggest that Moria was the most prosperous city in Middle Earth at this point. The other notable feature of this period was its length and stability; around 1500 years. Gundabad appears to have been in Dwarf hands again at some point in this time,[30] and this long period can be seen as the most significant period of Dwarf political domination and economic expansion in the history of Middle Earth.

The Longbeard Isolationist Period

The end of the Longbeard Trading Period comes with the shift from fighting mostly disorganised orc warbands to more protracted conflict with Sauron. This occurred in the late seventeenth century SA, and was a major catastrophe. The Dwarves lost their two main trading partners, Eregion and the Anduin humans, lost Gundabad, and had vital trade routes severed.[31] The decision of the King of Moria (probably Durin III but perhaps his successor) to shut the gates of Moria and not fight in Eregion's defence poisoned future trade relations with the Elves. The later Second Age presents a grimmer picture. Moria was still by far the dominant power, but increased reliance on humans for food meant that the economy needed to sharply rebalance from being a trading power to self-sufficiency; although still notably a key power in Middle Earth, Moria had to look primarily to its own defences and demographically began to decline.[32] This is of course the time when the Seven Rings were

---

[27] *The Peoples of Middle Earth*, "Of Dwarves and Men" p.303
[28] *Unfinished Tales*, "The History of Galadriel and Celeborn" p.304
[29] *Unfinished Tales*, "The History of Galadriel and Celeborn" p.303
[30] It must have been to have been recaptured by the orcs in the SA 1690s. *The Peoples Of Middle Earth*, "Of Dwarves and Men" p.305
[31] *The Peoples of Middle Earth*, "Of Dwarves and Men" p.305
[32] *The Lord of the Rings, Appendix A Part III*, p.1109

forged for the Dwarves; presumably this relates to the old system of kin-polities, though no leaders of the westernmost clans are recorded since the war with Doriath. There are no further references to kin-polities after this point; it probably seemed appropriate to Sauron and the Elven smiths to give their rings to titular kings, even if this did not reflect demographics or power effectively any more.

The end of the Second Age did not bring any great shock to Dwarf society; perhaps trade became a little more open given the end of the domination of Sauron, but significant trade with Arnor is not recorded. It seems likely some existed, of course, but this still seems to be a period of mostly self-sufficient holds with Longbeard pre-eminence. The Blue Mountain holds and the Iron Hills may have grown increasingly distant from Moria as a central reference point, with the relative lack of external trade. There were Dwarves in the Last Alliance,[33] but this probably did not greatly affect Dwarf society; Moria by this point was as a city-state well capable of sending out campaigning armies on such missions.

The end of this Longbeard-dominated isolationist period can really be seen around TA (Third Age) 1900. The huge time period between then and the loss of Eregion and the Anduin-men – about three and a half thousand years – of course raises a lot of questions as to how much stability there really was in Dwarf society over this time. Trade with Arnor cannot have been non-existent though there is a lack of information on political links that would signify this. Certainly the volume of trade with the Anduin-men was not repeated, though the Dwarf routes of the Longbeard Trading Period were still probably very much in use. The Blue Mountains were becoming increasingly poor in precious metals, but increasingly tempting as far as simple safety was concerned; Dwarf craftsmen may have had greater tendencies to work for human rulers at times with the power of the Arnorian and Gondorian monarchies. The basic theme, however, does seem to be stability; slow but stable trade routes, a loss of prominence compared to human trading centres, a self-sufficient food economy that could not sustain much population growth, and no major attempts to recapture old Dwarf settlements.

The Migrations Period and Late Hold Period

The period from TA 1900 to the end of the Third Age is perhaps the most interesting since the crisis of the early Second Age in terms of the very rapid changes in power structures, locations, demographics, and trade that occurred. Two major shocks caused this; the first was the destruction of Arnor, the second the loss of Moria.[34] Arnor's loss was not as bad for the Dwarves as it may at first seem; certainly population dropped rapidly, leading to decreased demand, but this in turn meant that politically and economically the dwarven holds were now larger centres than any human polity north of Rohan, or perhaps even Gondor. The movement of hobbits into some of the lands abandoned in Arnor and the

---

[33] *The Silmarillion*, p.294
[34] *The Lord of the Rings, Appendix B*, p.1123

foundation of the Shire were certainly good news for the Blue Mountain dwarves, ensuring a good source of food supplies for which tools could be exchanged. These were, of course, far overshadowed by the loss of Moria. This was not an instantaneous event so much as a year-long war; it seems probable that the Balrog was commander-in-chief as much as single ravaging monster of the forces that destroyed the Dwarrowdelf. With two Dwarf kings dead, and few ways to defend themselves against enemies attacking from inside their defences, the Dwarves finally abandoned the hold. This loss of the Dwarves' most productive mines and largest economic centre, coupled with the actual loss of life among Dwarf civilians and craftsmen, was a huge economic shock to Dwarf society.

For the first time since the late First Age, we see the foundation of entirely new holds, Erebor being the most prominent. It is not impossible that Nogrod and Belegost may also have taken in some survivors from the destruction of Moria, and the Grey Mountains[35] and Iron hills certainly did. Population movements were frequent: Thrain I founded Erebor, a generation later his son moved from there to the Grey Mountains (though it can probably be assumed that Erebor was not wholly uninhabited after that), and then his grandson Thror moved back south again after dragon attacks on the Grey Mountain hold or holds.[36] Erebor itself was then evacuated with the coming of Smaug, with Thorin Oakenshield as King of Durin's Line ending up in a small hold in the Blue Mountains. The periods of peace in Erebor and the Grey Mountains seem to have involved some demographic growth, but the declines, particularly as a result of the War of Dwarves and Orcs, seem to have been greater. The War brought no obvious territorial gains to the Dwarf alliance involved, but probably did have the major benefit of keeping the mountain passes open that connected the Blue Mountains to the increasingly eastern-focussed area around the Iron Hills and Erebor.

The Dwarf population is therefore likely to have shrunk significantly between TA 1900 and 2800, primarily in major shocks and losses on migration. During this period individual holds and hold-leaders were at their most powerful, and the Kings were effectively granted titular command of joint military forces but were otherwise one hold-lord among several, and were unable to function without the support of other magnates.[37] Economically the period was one of disruption but innovation; between Thrain's foundation and Smaug's attack, Erebor/Dale became a major new example of the old Dwarf/human links along the Anduin,[38] and this fuelled significant economic growth under Thror. The Blue Mountain holds, being relatively safe, began to exert a greater economic influence over Breeland and the Shire, with the Dwarf Road being the major remaining trading link through Eriador. The Iron Hills, meanwhile, had far less human intervention and probably continued being self-sufficient. The frequent movements and migrations of Dwarves probably made it much harder to establish permanent food supplies as compared to moving masonry tools or

---

[35] *The Lord of the Rings, Appendix A Part III*, p.1109
[36] *The Lord of the Rings, Appendix B*, p.1124
[37] "Dwarven Economy and Society: The Structures of Power", *Anor 41*, p.4-6
[38] *The Hobbit*, p.21-22

building a new smithy, so a greatly increased reliance on external food supplies can be seen.[39] This can be linked to an eventual increased cultural emphasis on masonry over metallurgy[40] (though mostly after the recapture of Erebor); Dwarves, living in hewn caves, have little internal demand for masonry, so their increased emphasis on it indicates much closer human trade links. From TA 2800 no further major population losses or migration are likely, although some losses were undoubtedly taken in battle in the War of the Ring. The increased availability and willingness to use external food supplies led to an efficient, if not wealthy, economy based on iron production, and to demographic growth starting again,[41] which accelerated significantly and moved to include the aforementioned use of masonry after the resettlement of Erebor. The trading culture was based more than ever around the individual hold; attempts at resettlement of Moria[42] and new settlements (for example at Aglarond[43]) indicate that Erebor under Dain II was expanding demographically up until the end of the Third Age.

At the end of the Third Age, Dwarf society was demographically expanding but societally fractured. The hold was no longer just settlement but city-state; trade was nevertheless increasing, and this was increasingly facing southwards to supply demand for masonry and metallurgy in a resurgent Gondor.[44] The rapidly expanded power of the humans under Aragorn Elessar, however, may have weakened the position of individual holds with regards to trading. Whether this occurred we shall, of course, never know.

Conclusion

This paper has been, to a great extent, a collation of raw information more than a serious attempt at analysis. It is fairly comprehensive in its assessment of long-term structural trends, though the flow is somewhat impaired by the fact that it sticks more to its sources than a sense of narrative. It is lacking where the sources are lacking – in discussions, for example, of exactly when mithril may have been discovered in Moria or indeed the state of the Longbeard polity in the First Age or Nogrod and Belegost thereafter. More noticeably this is a history of the greater holds; smaller settlements and those that were not important for political or external trading reasons are generally excluded from the annals. In general it seems unlikely that the trends sketched out here were not felt – perhaps felt even more sharply – by smaller holds, but the economic relationship between different holds and the likely existence and scale of smaller holds must be speculation left for a future paper. The schema of periods outlined is at this stage somewhat rough and may be subject to significant revisions in the future, but is at least a first attempt at outlining the demographic trends of the three western Dwarf clans (and is summarised in the timeline below). The

---

[39] *The Hobbit*, p.22
[40] *The Lord of the Rings: The Fellowship of the Ring*, p.246
[41] *The Lord of the Rings, Appendix A Part III*, p.1113
[42] Most obviously under Balin
[43] Under Gimli
[44] *The Lord of the Rings, Appendix A Part III*, p.1118

shifts of the "migrations" and "late hold" periods are perhaps the most blurred, but in placing the end of the War of Dwarves and Orcs as the last major exogenous population shock of the migrations period, I think demographically TA 2800 can at least be seen as a "low ebb" after which things began to improve. The factor most in favour of the period scheme given is simply that it provides future articles and nanophile (about as close to "dwarf-friendly" as a suitably coinable word can get) Tolkien scholars with a vocabulary to discuss economic, societal and demographic change. It probably opens many more questions than it answers, but hopefully this paper has at least started to pin down a chronological background and linguistic toolset to answer them.

TIMELINE

YT 1100-1500 EARLY HOLD PERIOD

- Rapid demographic and economic expansion
- Hold and clan warfare relatively common
- Kin-holds in the Blue and Misty Mountains with Petty-Dwarf holds in the Nargothrond region
- Pearls and weapons trade with Doriath
- Invention of chainmail, steel

FA 1-600 CLASSICAL KIN-POLITIES

- Destruction of Petty-Dwarf society
- Relatively strong kin-polities, self-sufficient with low population and economic growth
- Decreased trade with Doriath, increased weapons trade with Caranthir and Maedhros

SA 1-1690 LONGBEARD TRADING PERIOD

- Very large population movements from Gundabad, Nogrod, and Belegost to Moria
- Demographic expansion, political dominance over upper Anduin humans
- Economic specialisation, decreased native food production
- Moria dominant economic centre in northern Middle Earth
- Mithril trade with Elves, iron/steel weapons trade with humans

SA 1690-TA 1900 LONGBEARD ISOLATIONIST PERIOD

- Population stability due to limited resources and trade stagnation
- Few trading partners or opportunities, limited trade with Arnor
- Mistrust with neighbours
- Moria loses out to the cities of Arnor as a major economic centre

TA 1900-2800 MIGRATIONS PERIOD

- Repeated demographic shocks suppress population growth
- New holds founded rather than resettled to make homes for refugees
- Movements to Erebor and the Grey Mountains, then away to the Iron Hills and Blue Mountains
- Loss of most or all precious metal mines with Erebor and Moria gone post-Smaug, move to iron-based economy post-Smaug
- Foundation of Erebor/Dale food-trade system, but lost after Smaug
- War of the Dwarves and Orcs hits population but keeps trade routes open
- Political instability and uncertainty over precedence and social command structures

TA 2800-Fourth Age? LATE HOLDS PERIOD

- Dominance of the hold and hold-lord over the kin polity fully established
- Demographic growth fuelled by increased trading in food with the Shire and Dale
- Recapture of Erebor and increased use of precious metals again
- New holds founded and other attempted resettlements as population growth and demand for Dwarf skills becomes of increasing prominence
- Increased southern trade in Fourth Age, particularly as masons

A Short and probably Inaccurate First Age Chronology

Samuel Cook

In an attempt to assist everyone in understanding that most confusing of tomes, *The Silmarillion,* here follows a rough chronology of some of the important events of the First Age, based on what can be gleaned from said book and the LOTR appendices. It is necessarily a bit vague but hopefully it will help those of you who have got a bit lost reading the book! If anyone can improve the dating precision, please do let me know. Particularly problematic was the timeline between about 470 and 500 as the sources for this time seem to conflict. In the chapter "Of Túrin Turambar", the timeline of Túrin's life seems to be at odds (about two years out) with the timings of major events given elsewhere, primarily in the lives of Beren and Tuor (the chapters "Of Beren and Lúthien" and "Of Tuor and the Fall of Gondolin"). Some of the phrasing is a little vague and open to interpretation though, so what follows is my best attempt to reconcile the two apparently divergent timelines. Where a date range is given, e.g. 501-510, this means the events described happened sometime in that range but it has proven impossible to work out the exact year.

0	Fingolfin arrives in Middle Earth via the Helcaraxë following the Rape of the Silmarils; Fëanor and his followers having arrived by boat a few years earlier, before the First Age began. Fëanor fights the Dagor-nuin-Giliath (the Battle-under-Stars) and is slain at the end by Balrogs as he runs ahead of his victorious host to the very gates of Angband. Fingolfin becomes High King of the Noldor. End of the Ages of the Stars and beginning of the Ages of the Sun. The Moon rises for the first time as Fingolfin blows his trumpets and begins to march into Middle Earth with the Sun rising as he reaches Mithrim. Men awake in Hildórien, far to the East. Fingon rescues Maedhros from Thangorodrim.
20	Mereth Aderthad (The Feast of Reuniting) held by Fingolfin to heal the divisions among the Noldor and Sindar.
60	The Dagor Aglareb (Glorious Battle) in which the hosts of Morgoth are utterly defeated, beginning the Siege of Angband, which lasts for nearly 400 years. Shortly beforehand, Finrod begins Nargothrond (52) and, shortly afterwards (64), Turgon, Gondolin.
102	Nargothrond is completed.
116	Gondolin is completed. Turgon and all his people remove there and apparently disappear.

202	Aredhel leaves Gondolin to visit Fingon and the Sons of Fëanor but is enmeshed in Nan Elmoth by Eöl and marries him. Some years later, she returns to Gondolin with Maeglin, her son, leading to her and Eöl's death.
250	The Urulóki (Dragons) are seen for the first time when Glaurung makes a sortie from Angband but is repulsed by Elvish mounted archers, being still young and only half-grown. There follows the Long Peace of nearly 200 years.
c.310-4	Men arrive in Beleriand and are discovered by Finrod Felagund who begins the alliance of the Elves with the Three Houses of the Edain.
455	The Dagor Bragollach (Battle of Sudden Flame) in which Angrod and Aegnor, the younger brothers of Finrod and youngest sons of Finarfin, die. Also death of Hador, grandfather of Húrin and Huor. Fingolfin rides to Angband and challenges Morgoth to single combat, giving him several wounds and making him permanently lame before being defeated and killed. His body is then rescued by Thorondor, who gives Morgoth permanent facial scars. Fingon becomes High King of the Noldor. Húrin and Huor come to Gondolin. Barahir rescues Finrod and receives his ring in gratitude.
457	Fall of Tol Sirion to Sauron. Becomes Tol-in-Gaurhoth (The Isle of Werewolves). Orodreth, the warden of the tower and remaining younger brother of Finrod, escapes back to Nargothrond. The Easterlings (men not of the Three Houses of the Edain) arrive in Beleriand.
460	The outlaws of Dorthonion (Barahir and his 12 companions) are destroyed, save Beren, who remains alone in Dorthonion.
462	Death of Galdor, father of Húrin and Huor.
465	Beren flees from Dorthonion to Doriath via Nan Dungortheb. He meets Lúthien in the woods. Birth of Túrin, son of Húrin.
465-473	The Quest of the Jewel (of which rumours spread from 469). Beren and Lúthien manage to take a Silmaril from Morgoth's Iron Crown as Lúthien lulls Morgoth to sleep. Finrod renounces the lordship of Nargothrond, which passes to Orodreth, his brother, though Celegorm and Curufin (who fled there after the Dagor Bragollach) really hold power, in order to aid Beren. Celegorm and Curufin are driven out of Nargothrond when their treachery becomes clear. Finrod killed by a werewolf in the dungeons of Tol-in-Gaurhoth (though he first killed it with his bare hands and teeth). The Hunting of the Wolf (Carcharoth, who swallowed the Silmaril when he bit off Beren's hand outside Angband) finally recovers the Silmaril which is then delivered to Thingol in Doriath. Death of Huan, the Hound of Valinor, and of

Beren and Lúthien. Lúthien then moves Mandos to pity so she and Beren are both resurrected as mortals and go to live in Tol Galen.

472	Nirnaeth Arnoediad (Unnumbered Tears). Treachery of Ulfang the Black (a chieftain of the Easterlings) and his sons though Bór and his remain faithful. Deaths of Fingon (by Balrogs) and Huor (by arrows). Turgon becomes High King of the Noldor and opens the Leaguer of Gondolin to assist in the battle. When it becomes clear that the Noldor have lost the day, he retreats, screened by the men of Dor-lómin, led by Húrin and Huor, and returns to Gondolin, the location of which remains hidden from Morgoth. Húrin captured by Morgoth. Tuor, son of Huor, born.
473	Fall of the Falas. Círdan and Ereinion Gil-Galad, Fingon's son, and some of their people escape to the Isle of Balar. Túrin comes to Doriath and birth of Nienor, his sister.
473-510	Births of Dior, the son of Beren and Lúthien, and of his children, Eluréd, Elurín and Elwing.
484	Túrin flees Doriath after he believes himself to be wrongly accused of murder and sets himself up as a captain of a band of outlaws, naming himself Neithan.
487	Beleg finds Túrin and entreats him to return to Doriath but Túrin refuses. Beleg returns to Doriath and Túrin and his band remove to Amon Rûdh after a chance encounter with Mîm, the Petty-Dwarf, who lives there. At the end of the year, Beleg returns and finds Túrin upon Amon Rûdh, giving him the Dragon-Helm of Dor-lómin.
489	Túrin renames himself Gorthol and reveals himself to Morgoth through his wearing of the Dragon-Helm. Mîm is captured and betrays Túrin and his band. Túrin is captured but Beleg survives. Beleg meets Gwindor and rescues Túrin but is killed by him in the process as Túrin mistakes him for an enemy.
490-491	Túrin and Gwindor come to Nargothrond but Túrin names himself as Agarwaen, son of Úmarth, wishing to hide his identity. He also becomes known as the Mormegil, due to his prowess with Beleg's sword, Anglachel, which is reforged and renamed Gurthang. He is also named Adanedhel, due to his beauty.
491-496	Túrin's true identity becomes known in Nargothrond and the bridge over Narog is built at Túrin's bidding, revealing the location of Nargothrond to Morgoth. Morwen and Nienor flee Dor-lómin and arrive in Doriath.
491	Tuor escapes enslavement in Hithlum.

495-6	Year of the Fell Winter. The Sack of Nargothrond by forces under Glaurung. Deaths of Orodreth and Gwindor. Túrin tricked by Glaurung into searching for Morwen and Nienor in Dor-lómin instead of trying to rescue Finduilas, who had been captured by Orcs when Nargothrond fell. Tuor comes to Vinyamar in Nevrast where Ulmo appears to him, bidding him to seek out Gondolin to warn Turgon. Tuor arrives in Gondolin
497	Túrin arrives in Brethil, first calling himself Wildman of the Woods, and hears of the death of Finduilas. Then he adopts the name Turambar. Morwen and Nienor leave Doriath to seek Túrin but encounter Glaurung, who scatters their guards. Morwen is lost in the fog but Nienor is cursed with forgetfulness by Glaurung and, panicking at an Orc raid on the return to Doriath with her guards, runs from them and arrives in Brethil where she is given the name Níniel.
498	Túrin and Níniel marry. Glaurung hears that the Mormegil is in Brethil.
499	Níniel conceives. Glaurung attacks Brethil and is killed by Túrin. Níniel's curse is lifted and she commits suicide. Túrin learns of this and also commits suicide.
499-501	Húrin released by Morgoth and reveals the approximate location of Gondolin. Death of Morwen. Húrin brings the Nauglamír to Thingol.
501-511	Death of Húrin. Thingol joins the Nauglamír and the Silmaril in his possession and is killed by jealous Dwarves. Melian departs Middle Earth and the Girdle is broken. The Silmaril comes to Beren and Lúthien. Dior takes up the lordship of Doriath. Deaths of Beren and Lúthien. The Silmaril comes to Dior. The Ruin of Doriath due to assault by Sons of Fëanor in attempt to recover Silmaril. Deaths of Dior, Celegorm, Curufin and Caranthir. Elwing and the remnant of the people of Doriath flee with the Silmaril to the Mouths of Sirion and join up with Círdan and Gil-Galad on the Isle of Balar. Gondolin betrayed by Maeglin.
502	Tuor weds Idril Celebrindal.
503	Birth of Eärendil, the son of Tuor and Idril, later known as the Bright, the Blessed and the Mariner.
510	The Fall of Gondolin and deaths of Turgon and Maeglin. Tuor, Idril and Eärendil escape with a part of its people but run into Orcs led by a Balrog in the Encircling Mountains. Glorfindel fights the Balrog and both fall and die with the Orcs being destroyed by the Eagles. The remnant of the Gondolindrim, led by Tuor, reach the Mouths of Sirion where they join up

with the survivors of Doriath, led by Elwing. Gil-Galad becomes High King of the Noldor.

The above is the last definite date we have. Sometime after 511, Tuor and Idril set sail into the West; Eärendil marries Elwing; Elrond and Elros are born; the Sons of Fëanor attack the Mouths of Sirion to recapture the Silmaril but fail as Elwing escapes; Amrod and Amras die in the fighting; Eärendil and Elwing sail to Valinor in Vingilot due to the power of the Silmaril and successfully plead for help from the Valar; the War of Wrath, in which Morgoth is overthrown and thrust beyond the Walls of Night, occurs; Maedhros and Maglor steal the two remaining Silmarils but are burned by them so Maedhros throws his (and himself) into a fiery abyss and Maglor throws his into the Sea but survives (subsequent fate unknown); the First Age ends. Given that we know when Elros dies though and how old he is when this happens, due to the appendix in LOTR, we can work out some probable dates. We know that he is 58 at the end of the First Age as we are told he lives to the age of 500 and the appendix to LOTR gives the date of his death as S.A. 442. Therefore, assuming sensible dates for things, it seems likely that Eärendil would marry Elwing in about 530 (when he would be in his late twenties); that Elrond and Elros would have been born by 540; and that the First Age therefore ended sometime between 590 and 600 (it is worth noting that 590 seems to be the consensus date in such august repositories of knowledge as the Encyclopaedia of Arda).

Saruman the Fabulous: Tolkien and the Nature of Heroism

Jack Fleming

Author's Note: This article stemmed from discussions at the week two meeting of the CTS, Michaelmas term 2013. As such, I cannot claim sole authorship. However, the views expressed are my own and cannot be taken to represent those of the CTS. Nonetheless, I am indebted to all those involved. References for quotes are to the single volume film tie-in edition of *The Lord of the Rings*, held by the CTS (HarperCollins, 2001).

Heroes stand out. They go above and beyond the call of duty and are admired for it. This generalisation is as true in Tolkien's Legendarium as in the myths with which Tolkien was so well acquainted, and which served as the prime inspiration for his works. Beowulf was recognised as the greatest warrior of the Geats and was so assured of his own martial prowess that he refused to carry a weapon when facing Grendel so as not to gain an unfair advantage; how much more ostentatious can one get? Similarly, after his prophetic dream of Isildur's Bane, Halflings, Imladris and the Sword-that-was-Broken, Boromir insisted that he, rather than his younger brother Faramir, go to Rivendell, despite the objections of Denethor who would have preferred Boromir to remain to direct the defence of Gondor. We get the feeling that Boromir sought to make himself exceptional, he demonstrates a sort of rugged individualism.

There is, however, another facet to Tolkien's heroes. Sam speaks of his childhood view that adventures were 'things the wonderful folk of the stories went out and looked for, because they were exciting and life was a bit dull" before gloomily coming to the conclusion that "folk seem to have been just landed in them".[45] This mirrors perfectly the experiences of the hobbits, who fell into the business of the Ring by way of its chance discovery by Bilbo. They did not seek to make themselves heroes, but simply failed to keep their feet as they stepped out the door, and so were swept off. How then, are such mild and comfort-loving creatures presented as heroes? The answer lies in the way they abandon the typical definitions of hobbits. Although, as Gandalf regularly noted, hobbits are exceptional creatures with considerably more to them than meets the eye, the norms of hobbit life are insular and homely. In accepting their role in the War of the Ring, the hobbits turned their backs on hearth and home and crossed over the Edge of the Wild. They denied the typical roles of hobbits.

This pattern is discernible across the heroes of the Third Age (I assume it is also the case through the rest of the history of Middle Earth, but am not qualified to comment). Legolas and Gimli were both Manly Warriors, but arguably what set them apart as heroes was the way in which they moved past the centuries long distrust between their two species. They did not self-consciously set themselves apart, but they did deny what is the norm for their respective peoples. Éowyn stood out as heroic by refusing to accept the role assigned to her as a woman, which she saw as a cage, and was thereby able to do what 'no

---

45   *The Two Towers*, 'The Stairs of Cirith Ungol', p.696.

living man' could do, namely kill the Witch King.[46] Meanwhile Aragorn spent much of his time wrestling with his status as the heir of Isildur, but was able to succeed where his forefather failed. In contrast to Boromir, who was overcome by the lure of the Ring, albeit arguably with the best intentions, and even more strikingly, the Nazgûl, Aragorn did not fall under the Ring's sway, and so broke with the norm that Men desire power above all else, which corrupts, regardless of the purity of motivation. The failure of Boromir's heroism was caused by his desire to claim a power which could save Gondor; he "was ever anxious for the victory of Minas Tirith (and his own glory therein)".[47] What would, outside the Legendarium, be the act of a hero is twisted in Tolkien's world into the very thing which destroyed Boromir's honour, which arguably he only recovered by giving up his life to defend Merry and Pippin. Faramir was his brother's antithesis and showed this explicitly; Boromir was enticed by the Ring, but Faramir "would not take this thing, if it lay by the highway. Not were Minas Tirith falling in ruin and I alone could save her, so, using the weapon of the Dark Lord for her good and my glory. No, I do not wish for such triumphs".[48] Thus he not only demonstrated the great difference between himself and Boromir, but also the same heroic virtue as was held by Aragorn.

This is of course to simplify grossly the character development of heroes in Tolkien's world, but it serves as an introduction to the matter, and brings me on to the wizards. The wizards, though they may not appear so, were of an entirely different nature to the other creatures involved with the business of the Ring, with the exceptions of the Balrog and Sauron himself. They were Maiar, angelic beings, who are given human form as Istari and sent into the world in order to oppose Sauron. Their very purpose was, therefore, their role in the War of the Ring. However, significantly they were sent to guide, not rule. Gandalf explicitly embodied this role, by serving as physical guide to the Fellowship after their departure from Rivendell (and giving occasional prods to the party of Thorin Oakenshield in the business with the Dragon), and by directing the military actions of both Rohan and Gondor in the last phases of the war. He openly removed the insipid council of Gríma from Théoden, and thereafter took the role of chief counsellor to the more traditional heroes, alongside seeking out and directing Erkenbrand to come to the aid of Helm's Deep. Of course, Gandalf also actively engaged in the battles, but this is to some extent secondary to his role in counselling action over isolationism.[49] Rather than denying his nature, as is the norm for Tolkien's heroes, Gandalf was at his most heroic when he was actively engaged in what he was put on Middle Earth to do, rather than making fireworks and smoking pipe-weed.

---

46   *The Return of the King,* 'The Battle of the Pelennor Fields', p.823.
47   *The Two Towers,* 'The Window on the West', p.656.
48   Ibid.
49   Yes, I am beginning to see certain aspects of the Legendarium as a critique of the inter-war policies and outlook of a certain North American country... Somebody should write something about that.

Having said that, as already mentioned, the Istari where given human form in order to interact with events, and in so doing, took on a second nature, that of Men, the same nature which Aragorn struggled to overcome, and which defeated Boromir. Just like the heroes of Men, Gandalf recognised the draw of power, but his dual nature allowed him to see the doom such power would bring with it. Even though the desire to do good could lead him to use the Ring, "over [him] the Ring would gain a power greater and more deadly... the wish to wield it would be too great".[50] Although torn between two natures, Gandalf remained in touch with the angelic nature, and did not choose to make himself other than he was, though he knew it could be hugely beneficial in the coming storm.

This brings me, finally, to Saruman, who chose to make himself more than he was. Saruman the White made himself Saruman of Many Colours. Why? Because for him, white only "serve[d] as a beginning. White cloth may be dyed. The white page can be overwritten".[51] Given this smial's association with one of the world's great centres of learning, we can perhaps understand that last line. For Saruman, much as paper can be written on, and so imbued with a meaning beyond what it once had, so too his own nature could be improved to create Saruman of Many Colours. He self-identified as "Saruman the Wise", but he revealed his foolishness when he said "the white light can be broken", which was of course picked up on by Gandalf as a departure from the path of wisdom.[52] Were he to have stopped there, we could write this off as his humanity overcoming the Istari facet within his nature, motivated only by the desire for knowledge of all shades, not only white. But Saruman went further than this. In a significant line (which I had not previously noticed), he also describes himself as a "Ring-maker", putting himself on a level with the elven smiths who forged the Rings of Power, but also with the very Dark Lord who he and his kind were put on Middle Earth to stop. He went on to say that the ages of Elves had passed, and that the new age should be governed by the Wise "for that good which only the Wise can see", which again implies a twisting of motives, which might have been good, to an evil end, as, to do this, he is willing to join with Sauron so that in time he could usurp the Dark Lord's power.[53] For Saruman, the ends of order and control justified any means necessary. That was why he was willing to break the perfect white light into many colours, whilst still, at first sight, appearing to remain white.

Saruman's villainy, therefore, lay in his decision to go against his own nature. Of course, this may not have been a truly free choice. Saruman had in his possession a palantír, which may well have led to his corruption by Sauron. But what is (to my knowledge) unclear is the level to which any influence from the Dark Lord required something to prey upon. For a heart to be corrupted, was there some initial level of imperfection required, and if so, were the heroes of the Legendarium simply pure in heart, or were they, as seems more

---

50   *The Fellowship of the Ring*, 'The Shadow of the Past', p.60.
51   *The Fellowship of the Ring*, 'The Council of Elrond', p.252.
52   Ibid.
53   Ibid.

likely (and certainly more interesting), flawed and broken, but able to overcome that brokenness? I would argue for the latter being true. To put it another way, Saruman already desired rule and order (though perhaps envisaging a benevolent dictatorship), and this desire was twisted by Sauron. As Susan Cooper phrases it in *The Dark is Rising*, the dark loves to "twist good emotion to accomplish ill";[54] for her, villains are created "whenever a man deliberately chose to be changed into something more dread and powerful than his fellows", as in the case of Boromir or Saruman.[55] Though many of Tolkien's heroes went against their nature, it was not to set themselves up as superior in the way that Boromir and Saruman did. Even after his apparent defeat at Orthanc, Saruman was not happy unless he was governing others, which lead to his brief rule over the Shire as Sharkey.

Of course, there is another explanation, which my title hinted at. Tolkien's world is very masculine. The heroes go about as warriors, in earthy colours, with weapons and armour. There is little space in such an epic for a fashion sense. Maybe Saruman was fed up with the limited scope of dress options and wanted to bring some colour to everyone's lives. He just wanted things to be a little more *fabulous*. Of course, Tolkien being a strict Roman Catholic could never have approved of that sort of thing, so Saruman had to become a villain. Maybe for Tolkien, there is a correlation between campness and evil. He certainly has a thing about jewellery. And of course, no matter how homoerotic any relationship gets, nowhere in the entire Legendarium does one Manly Warrior get to tell another Manly Warrior that *his booty is looking fly!*

---

54   *The Dark is Rising*, 'The Sign Seeker': *The Dark is Rising* is an excellent book, of a similar tone, but on a considerably less grand scale, and the second part of a sequence which you should ALL READ of the same name. References are to chapter only, as I did not have access to a copy at the time of writing.
55   *The Dark is Rising,* 'Betrayal'.

Entish Language, Entish Mind

Jamie Douglas

The Entish Condition

The Entish language is unique among all the languages in Tolkien's mythology. Ents, it seems, are naturally dumb, i.e. non-speaking, as Treebeard recounts on more than one occasion (all quotes are from the chapter entitled *Treebeard* in *The Two Towers*, unless otherwise indicated):

> "Elves began it, of course, waking trees up and teaching them to speak and learning their tree-talk. They always wished to talk to everything, the old Elves did."

> "It was the Elves that cured us of dumbness long ago, and that was a great gift that cannot be forgotten, though our ways have parted since."

However, although Ents are skilled at learning languages and have a particular fondness for the ancient High-elven tongue (see Appendix F) using many Elven roots and word forms, the structure of the Entish language is wholly unlike anything Elvish (or Mannish or Dwarvish or anything else for that matter). In this article, I will offer some speculations on how the structure of the Entish language is related to and reflects the nature of the Ents themselves: in essence, the relationship between Entish language and Entish mind.

The Structure of Entish

In Appendix F, Tolkien explicitly states that the Ents made Entish. In this respect, Ents are like Elves (and presumably Men) since they created their own language. However, as pointed out above, Ents are not naturally a 'speaking people' since they needed the Elves to cure them of dumbness. In this latter respect, they may resemble Dwarves, who learned the speech that Aulë had devised for them (see *Of Aulë and Yavanna* in *The Silmarillion*). Of course, this assumes that Dwarves could not have become a speaking people without explicit instruction, but given that neither Dwarves nor Ents are strictly children of Ilúvatar, this assumption is at least not implausible. Nevertheless, as soon as Ents learned to speak, it seems a linguistic potential was awoken that allowed them to devise their own unique language. In Appendix F, Tolkien describes the language that the Ents made for themselves thus:

> "The language that they had made was unlike all others: slow, sonorous, agglomerated, repetitive, indeed long-winded; formed of a multiplicity of vowel-shades and distinctions of tone and quality which even the lore-masters of the Eldar had not attempted to represent in writing. They used it only among themselves; but they had no need to keep it secret, for no others could learn it."

The eagle-eyed reader may have noticed that Tolkien claims that no others could learn Entish, yet Treebeard claims that the old Elves taught Ents their language and, in return, learned their tree-talk. We could attribute this apparent contradiction to any number of things: authorial inconsistency, mistakes on the part of Treebeard or the 'compiler' of the appendices, or perhaps tree-talk was a sort of Proto-Entish or pidgin-Entish that others were capable of learning before the Entish linguistic potential really kicked in to make the more developed language unlearnable. For any Formal Language Theory-inclined readers, this latter option suggests that Entish falls outside of the class of possible human (or elf) grammars, which suggests that the Entish mind, as funny, queer or slow as it may seem, is in fact capable of greater feats of mental computation than the human or elf mind. Something tells me, though, that this was not of any great concern to Tolkien, so I leave these speculations aside.

Phonological Structure

The description of Entish given above refers to a multiplicity of vowel-shades and distinctions of tone and quality which appeared to be beyond the skill of Elvish lore-masters to put in writing. Of course, this could simply mean that the Eldar had not developed a writing system capable of capturing the necessary distinctions found in Entish, i.e. there was no suitable Eldarin equivalent to the International Phonetic Alphabet. But given the comment that no others could learn the language, I assume that the Eldar could not, in most instances, discern the differences that the Ents were capable of producing and comprehending (see Ardalambion), excluding any Eldar-equivalents of Henry Higgins, of course! This would suggest that any IPA-type system among Elves or Men would have been to no avail for the transcription of Entish. Therefore, let's assume that, like in extant human languages, vowels could vary according to height, backness, rounding, length and tone. However, whilst human languages can typically make up to four height distinctions, three backness distinctions, two rounding distinctions, three length distinctions and three tonal levels (not counting contour tones), let's interpret the description above as saying that Ents are capable of many more distinctions in each of these dimensions, and possible distinctions in other dimensions as well. This might account for the musical quality that Entish is described as having.

To be capable of such fine-grained distinctions in production, and sensitive to these distinctions in comprehension, Ents presumably have greater motor control over their vocal apparatus and greater acoustic sensitivity than the other speaking peoples. Furthermore, it is possible that Ents do not become as set in their phonological ways as the other speaking peoples. It is well-known that humans have difficulty distinguishing sounds that are not phonemic in their native language(s), but which are phonemic in a foreign language. One well-known example is the difficulty that many Chinese, Japanese and Korean speakers have with the phonemes /r/ and /l/ in English. It is clearly not the case that Chinese, Japanese and Korean people are inherently incapable of perceiving or producing the difference between

English /r/ and /l/ since a child born to parents from these language backgrounds brought up in an English-speaking environment will invariably pick up the differences with ease. Similarly, English speakers are typically baffled by Chinese tones, which Chinese speakers do not bat an eyelid at. Again, English speakers are not inherently incapable of producing or perceiving tones, but because English does not make use of tones in its phonology, English speakers lose their innate sensitivity to such distinctions as they become set in the ways of English. This effect is often related to the idea of a critical period, i.e. a period of cognitive plasticity, during which a learner is able to successfully acquire the structural properties of the ambient language. After this period, structural properties cannot be learned, presumably because the mind is no longer 'plastic' enough. Therefore, we might say that the Ents do not have a critical period, which would mean they are sensitive to many minor details in any and all languages that they come across in ways that other beings are not. In a sense, Ents retain the cognitive plasticity, which is present in the infants but not the adults of other peoples, throughout their lives. This would account for their species-wide ability to pick up languages remarkably swiftly.

Morpho-Syntactic Structure

Perhaps the most striking property of Entish is the fact that what is a mono-syllabic noun in the Common Speech may correspond to an entire story in Entish, as Treebeard puts it:

> "*Hill*. Yes, that was it. But it is a hasty word for a thing that has stood here ever since this part of the world was shaped."

Indeed, Treebeard's circumlocution may be somewhat more typical of an Entish expression.

> "I can see and hear (*and* smell *and* feel) a great deal from this, from this, from this *a -lalla-lalla-rumba-kamanda-lind-or-burúmë*. Excuse me: that is a part of my name for it; I do not know what the word is in the outside languages: you know, the thing we are on, where I stand and look out on fine mornings, and think about the Sun, and the grass beyond the wood, and the horses, and the clouds, and the unfolding of the world."

I think it would thus be plausible to say that Entish differs most from other languages in the domain of nominals. Without getting too bogged down in the details of what a nominal actually is, which is by no means straightforward, I would like to point out that, contrary to the traditional notion that nouns are words for things or entities, nouns should more accurately (though still vaguely) be considered labels for concepts, i.e. the mental constructs which things and entities in the real world map onto in some way. To take an example, the word *hill* does not refer directly to any individual hill in the world, rather it refers to the concept of hill. Now, judging from the similarities between extant human languages and the languages of Middle Earth (except Entish), we can say that Men and Elves (and Hobbits,

Dwarves, Orcs, Maiar and Valar, it would seem) are perfectly happy to assign words to concepts. Ents, of course, can do this since they are perfectly capable of learning and using non-Entish languages, but the point is that Ents may also do things differently as Treebeard points out. Entish nouns, if they can be called nouns at all, do not label concepts so much as the thing or entity itself. In fact, the traditional notion of noun is arguably more applicable to Entish nouns than the nouns of any other language! Returning to the hill example, other languages use a short word such as *hill* for the concept of hill since the concept has not been there since that part of the world was made even if the hill itself has been. Given the widespread use of concept-formation in non-Ents, it is little wonder that this is the case. Only Ents conceptualise the world in a way sensitive to the latter concern. As such, Entish words grow to reflect the passing of time and the thing or entity's place within that time, whilst the words of other languages do not because they label mental constructs which are only indirectly related to their denotations in the real world. As Treebeard says of his own name:

> "My name is growing all the time, and I've lived a very long, long time; so *my* name is like a story. Real names tell you the story of the things they belong to in my language, in the Old Entish as you might say."

Admittedly, this method of description might only apply to proper (or real) names, but given Treebeard's comments regarding the use of the word *hill*, I assume that this method may extend to nouns more generally. If so, this gives a whole new perspective on the historical linguistics dictum: *chaque mot a son histoire* ('every word has its history')!

So it seems that Ents are capable of, but not as willing to, conceptualise the world in the way that Elves and Men do. Instead, they prefer to see something for what it is, rather than what they think it is.

> "For Ents are more like Elves: less interested in themselves than Men are, and better at getting inside other things."

One way of reading this in light of the discussion so far is that Ents bypass the concept stage to some degree giving a much closer relationship between their language and the real world. As such, Entish names change with the world, as Treebeard goes on to say:

> "And yet again Ents are more like Men, more changeable than Elves are, and quicker at taking the colour of the outside, you might say."

Nevertheless, the Entish way of seeing the world is ultimately unlike that of Elves or Men. Of course, the difference between Men and Ents, at least, could be down to the fact that the latter are immortal. It would not do for Men to have a language like Entish since, given the perils of the world, many would probably only be able to produce about a paragraph's worth of utterances before kicking the bucket. Ents, by contrast, have the luxury of time.

Treebeard admits he could spend a whole week just breathing; something that would very much hasten the kicking of that bucket among Men!

The difference between Elves and Ents, however, must be something other than the availability of time. Perhaps then the difference lies in the use of that time. Treebeard says that Ents are perhaps better than Elves (and Men) in that they are "steadier and keep their minds on things for longer". I tentatively propose that this accounts for the Ents' repetitive speech style. Consider Treebeard's description of Lórien:

"*Laurelindórenan lindelorendor malinornélion ornemalin*"

In Letter 230 (from *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*), Tolkien writes that this roughly translates as "The valley where the trees in a golden light sing musically, a land of music and dreams; there are yellow trees there, it is a tree-yellow land." I assume this phrase uses Quenya lexical items but ultimately an Entish type of syntax. Entish syntax thus appears to be something between a compositional and a combinatorial system. It is compositional in that the meaning of the whole is a function of the meaning of its parts, but note that the second and fourth words are essentially permutations of the first and third words respectively. I speculate that, in keeping their minds on things for longer, Ents run through a number of combinations of words which all have roughly the same meaning but which perhaps highlight particular nuances of whatever the Ents have noticed. Of course, this could be a reflex of the notion that everything is inter-related in Entish. If Entish words are stories for the things and entities themselves, each thing or entity is presumably described in terms of other things and entities, which are described in terms of yet other things and entities, etc, ad infinitum. It is therefore possible that an Entish sentence must contain circumlocutions, both in the sense of roundabout ways of saying things, but also in the sense that the first thing must be defined in terms of a second thing which itself must be defined in terms of the first, i.e. circular descriptions. If descriptions are circular, compositionality falls apart. Therefore, by juxtaposing permutations of various parts of a circular description, Entish is able to get across a wealth of meaning whilst remaining true to its character. The result is, however, extremely long-winded and repetitive for non-Ents.

Entish Communication

Until now, I have said nothing about what the structure of Entish when used *amongst* Ents can tell us about the Entish mind. The following is the description of the discussion that takes place at the Entmoot:

"As soon as the whole company was assembled, standing in a wide circle round Treebeard, a curious and unintelligible conversation began. The Ents began to murmur slowly: first one joined and then another, until they were all chanting together in a long rising and falling rhythm, now louder on one side of the ring, now dying away there and rising to a great boom on the other side."

Perhaps the strangest aspect of Entish conversations given what we have discussed already is that everyone is talking at the same time. Perhaps Ents have the ability to attend to multiple conversations simultaneously whilst also speaking themselves. This style of 'conversation' is reminiscent of the Ainulindalë, except the Entmoot is clearly a debate. It is also reminiscent of the 'conversation' that Gandalf and the Elves have towards the end of *The Return of the King* just before the people of Lórien return across the Misty Mountains. However, this conversation is one of thought whereas the Entmoot is very much an audible conversation and one that all members of the species seem capable of participating in. Nevertheless, Ents do seem to have some sort of notion of turn-taking as Quickbeam recounts in the story of how he got his name. Therefore, we can conclude that Ents are capable of simultaneous conversation, which perhaps goes some way to compensating for the amount of time it takes for any one Ent to say anything.

Let's make the plausible assumption that the aim of communication is to transmit as efficiently as possible a message as accurately as possible. In general, in the languages of Men and Elves, this means giving frequent or predictable bits of information as small a form as possible, i.e. make common words shorter than less common words. The use of nouns rather than hugely lengthy descriptions would also be a reflection of this. At first glance, it seems that Entish does not care about this to the same extent as other languages, since many words are effectively stories. But consider what Treebeard says:

> "[Entish] is a lovely language, but it takes a very long time to say anything in it, because we do not say anything in it, unless it is worth taking a long time to say, and to listen to."

Ents do not communicate verbally unless something important is afoot. Consequently, it is not clear that certain aspects of Entish are notably more frequent or predictable than others. Therefore, nothing much is gained in Entish if the length of words is reduced. Furthermore, the lack of nouns or proper names resulting from the way Ents conceptualise the world means that, in order to establish whatever is being discussed, a lengthy description must be used to ensure everyone is talking about the same thing. Indeed, much of the conversation might consist of everyone 'updating' their Entish given that Ents talk infrequently and the language grows with time!

Conclusion

I have speculated that the Ents are capable of making phonemic distinctions that no other species can make and suggested this is related to their general language-learning abilities. I have also proposed that Ents are able to perceive the world more directly than others by utilising a different mechanism for conceptualising the world. This is reflected in Entish morpho-syntax. Finally, I suggested that Ents are subject to the same sorts of communicative trade-offs as other species but that these trade-offs are manifested differently as a function of the structure of Entish, which itself reflects the Entish mind.

BREAKING NEWS!
RADAGAST IS ACTUALLY SAURON!!!

Hannah Strachan

You don't believe me? Here are the reasons why:

1. You never see the two of them in the same place at once.
2. Both are Maiar so difference of species isn't an issue.
3. Radagast makes absolutely no effort to fight Sauron in the War of the Ring, making the most petty excuse that he's too busy with his forest duties. He is actually busy with his orc commanding duties.
4. After Sauron is ultimately vanquished Radagast is not seen again either.
5. Radagast only appears in Middle Earth after Sauron's lost both the Ring and his ability to bear a "fair shape".
   - Radagast definitely does NOT have a "fair shape" as he is an old, dirty man with bird nest and poo in his hair.
6. Radagast and Sauron both live in the Mirkwood area at the same time.
7. When the White Council (of whom Radagast was an outside member) attacked Dol Guldur, Sauron wasn't surprised by the attack as he already knew of it by being Radagast.
   - When Sauron "gave in" and "ran away" at the White Council's attack he was never actually seen by them. In all likelihood he'd already moved back to Barad-dûr while leaving a minor force to make the battle appear realistic, and was thus able to attend the fight as Radagast without creating suspicion.
8. Radagast happily leads Gandalf to Saruman's trap NOT because Radagast is a fool but because, as Sauron, it is very useful for him to have Gandalf out of the way.
9. The (non-canonical) film, *The Hobbit*, shows Radagast performing necromancy on a hedgehog, a skill that Sauron 'The Necromancer' owned.
   - Also at this point, the giant spiders of Mirkwood only leave Radagast alone after they witness his necromancy which proves his evil identity. Sauron wasn't 'saving' Sebastian but himself.
10. The (non-canonical) film, *The Hobbit*, also shows Radagast offering to help the dwarves by leading the orcs away BUT he actually brings the orcs closer to the dwarves' hiding spot because he's actually evil Sauron.

CONCLUSION: RADAGAST AND SAURON <u>MUST</u> BE ONE AND THE SAME!!!

Why call a spade a spade when you can call it a manual earth-restructuring implement? Pentagon jargon applied to Middle Earth

Samuel Cook

Here are some selected suggestions for what the Pentagon, using their impenetrable jargon, might call some Middle Earth objects:

Athelas: multipurpose cellulose-based medicinal compound

Cram: emergency high-fibre food substitute

Durin VII: vertically-challenged quasi-human of undefined fabulousness

Dwarf: vertically-challenged aurophilic quasi-human

Eagle: predatory supersized avian deus ex machine

Elf: temporally-unlimited anthropoidal entity

Flet: high-altitude arboreal discoid accommodation structure

Galenas: organic combustible relaxant

Hobbit: excessively-nourished diminutive anthropoid

Ithildin: lunar-activated clandestine visual communication substance

Lembas: high-energy long-life portable bread-like food disc

Mathom: non-essential personal object of unspecified use

Miruvor: emergency definitely-non-alcoholic revival beverage

Mithril: omni-protective ultralight personal defence system

Orc: morally-challenged human substitute

Palantír: long-range high-resolution real-time audiovisual communication spheroid

Silmaril: ultra-luminescent sanctified mineral derivative

The Ring: personal annular malevolence-oriented power enhancer

Thranduil: ambulatory high-fidelity high-volume persistent celebratory audio output device (unst, unst, unst – also, racist party king Dad)

Warg: ravening lupine horse substitute

Cousin Glóin

James Baillie

(To the tune of "Cousin Jack" by Show of Hands, and with apologies to Steve Knightley)

Spoken:

When the Dwarves fled Erebor, as they did in their thousands, they were known as Cousin Glóins and Cousin Glóinhildas. A tight knit bunch, and unlike the other nations of Middle-Earth, they never really captured and romanticised their music in the same way; but they're all there beneath the surface…

Sung:
This land is bar-ren and bro-ken,
Charred like the face of the moon
Khuzdul no lon-ger spo-ken
And the towns in the Dale face ruin
Will there be work in the Iron Hills?
Or gold in the mountains so blue?
I've heard there are caves in Far Harad
But the rock there's too hard to dig through

Where there's a mine or a hole in the ground
That's what I'm heading for, that's where I'm bound
So look for me under the lode and inside the vein,
Where the copper, the clay, the arsenic and tin
Colour your beard and get under your skin
I'm leaving the mountain behind, got to find a new mine
Oh follow me down cousin Glóin!

The soil's too poor to make Lórien,
To farm by the sea's not a choice
Though visions of Moria sustained us,
Since great Aulë gave us a voice
Since Durin once walked down to Mirrormere
Since first he awoke from his dream
And his heirs at last fell to the darkness,
They found at the heart of the seam.

Where there's a mine or a hole in the ground
That's what I'm heading for, that's where I'm bound
So look for me under the lode and inside the vein,
Where the copper, the clay, the arsenic and tin
Colour your beard and get under your skin
I'm leaving the mountain behind, got to find a new mine

Oh follow me down cousin Glóin!

Follow me
Through Dunland, Eriador, through Gondor or Rhovanion
Where there's a mine
Or a hole in the ground
I'm leaving the mountain, my home, my town
Nogrod, Moria, Belegost, Erebor, Gundabad
Remember us
Our foreign tongue names, bearded faces
When you hear the doors crash
When you see the wyrm swoop down
Home again.
Are you home again?
I dream of a tunnel,
A side door.
In a mountain far off
To the east
And in my dream I see the dale-men rebuilding their houses
I see the Dragon, killed to set us free…

Where there's a mine or a hole in the ground
That's what I'm heading for, that's where I'm bound
So look for me under the lode and inside the vein,
Where the copper, the clay, the arsenic and tin
Colour your beard and get under your skin
I'm leaving the mountain behind, got to find a new mine
Oh follow me down cousin Glóin!
Follow me down cousin Glóin!
Follow me down…

Riddles in the Dark

James Baillie

(To the tune of "Poisoning Pigeons in the Park" by Tom Lehrer)

The Ring's not here,
The R-R-Ring's not here,
We doesn't know if it's far or near,
We think the loveliest thing around here is the Ring,
We do (don't you? Of course you do…)
But the One Ring, it's gone, it's our dear precious…
The One Ring the Bagginses stoled from us…

All the world seemed in tune
On that dark afternoon
When we sat playing riddles in the dark.
With no light to see,
The Baggins and me,
We just sat playing riddles in the dark.

Voiceless it crieses and wingless it flutters,
Toothless it biteses and mouthless it mutters…
We thoughts he'd be dead
But then "wind" Baggins said
As we sat and played riddles in the dark,

Tra-la, tra-la-la-la-la-la

We've gained much notoriety
And caused much anxiety
In wizardly society
With our games
But we only eats fishes
And daintier dishes
If silly fat hobbits
Can't guess the right names!
And we won't bite its soft juicy middle,
If only it answers our riddle…

But our ring now is lost,
For we were double-crossed
When we sat playing riddles in the dark
It's a thief and it lies!
We hate Baggins, we cries
As it ran from our riddles in the dark.

What box has no hinge, and no key and no lid,
But inside a nice golden treasure is hid?
The answers is eggs,
Let us eats you, we begs,
But it cheated at riddles,
With our precious it fiddles,
As it runs from our riddles in the dark!